

# COUNTY COUNCIL

## 18<sup>th</sup> JANUARY 2017

**Present: Councillor E. Morgan (Chair)**

**Councillors:**

S.M. Allen	J.S. Edmunds	D.M. Jenkins	A.D.T. Speake
D.J.R. Bartlett	P. Edwards	J.P. Jenkins	L.M. Stephens
T. Bowen	D.C. Evans	A.W. Jones	E.G. Thomas
S.M. Caiach	H.A.L. Evans	G.O. Jones	G.B. Thomas
C.A. Campbell	L.D. Evans	T.J. Jones	G. Thomas
J.M. Charles	W.J.W. Evans	A. Lenny	M.K. Thomas
A.P. Cooper	W.T. Evans	M.J.A. Lewis	R. Thomas
D.M. Cundy	M. Gravell	D.J.R. Llewellyn	S.E. Thomas
A. Davies	A.D. Harries	K. Madge	W.G. Thomas
D.B. Davies	C.P. Higgins	S. Matthews	D. Tomos
G. Davies	W.G. Hopkins	A.G. Morgan	D.E. Williams
J.A. Davies	J.K. Howell	J. Owen	J. Williams
S.L. Davies	P. Hughes-Griffiths	P.A. Palmer	J.E. Williams
T. Davies	P.M. Hughes	D. Price	J.S. Williams
W.R.A. Davies	I.J. Jackson	D.W.H. Richards	
T. Devichand	A. James	B.A.L. Roberts	
E. Dole	J.D. James	H.B. Shepardson	

**The following officers were in attendance:**

Mr. M James – Chief Executive  
Mr. C. Moore – Director of Corporate Services  
Mr. J. Morgan – Director of Community Services  
Mr. G. Morgans – Interim Director of Education & Children’s Services  
Mrs. R. Mullen – Director of Environment  
Ms. L. Rees Jones – Head of Administration & Law  
Mr. P. Thomas – Assistant Chief Executive (People Management)  
Mrs. W. Walters – Assistant Chief Executive (Regeneration & Policy)  
Mr. S. Davies – School Modernisation Manager (*for Item 11.1*)  
Miss S. Griffiths – Graduate Trainee Project Officer (MEP) (*for Item 11.1*)  
Mr. M. Hughes – Democratic Services Officer

**Also in attendance:**

Chief Fire Officer Chris Davies, Mid & West Wales Fire and Rescue Service (*for Item 5*)  
Deputy Chief Fire Officer Mick Crennell, Mid & West Wales Fire and Rescue Service (*for Item 5*)  
Mr. M. Jones – Superfast Cymru Programme Manager, BT Group (*for Item 6*)

**Venue:** County Hall Chamber, Carmarthen (10:00am – 2:25pm)

## 1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors T. Bowen, I.W. Davies, T.T. Defis, M. Gravell, H.I. Jones (Vice-Chair), W.J. Lemon, J. Thomas, K.P. Thomas and J. Tremlett.

## 2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTERESTS

Councillor	Minute Item(s)	Nature of Interest
J.A. Davies	Item 11.1	His son is a teacher.
J. Edmunds	Item 11.1	His daughter works in a school.
D. C. Evans	Item 5	He is a member of the Mid & West Wales Fire Authority.
L.D. Evans	Item 11.1	Her daughter is a teacher.
W. G. Hopkins	Item 11.1	He is a governor on the Federated Llangennech School Governing Body.
G.O. Jones	Item 11.1	His wife is a teacher.
D.J.R. Llewellyn	Item 5	He is a member of the Mid & West Wales Fire Authority.
A.D.T. Speake	Item 10	He is in receipt of a war disability pension.
E. G. Thomas	Item 5 Item 11.1	He is a member of the Mid & West Wales Fire Authority. His daughter is a teacher in a Local Authority school.
G. Thomas	Item 11.1	She is a governor on the Federated Llangennech School Governing Body.
D. E. Williams	Item 5	He is a member of the Mid & West Wales Fire Authority.
J. Williams	Item 5	She is a member of the Mid & West Wales Fire Authority.

### 3. CHAIR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

Councillor G. Thomas informed the Council that the South Wales Touring Park at Llwynifan Farm in Llangennech had recently won a Welsh Hospitality Award for the Best Caravan Site in Wales and wished to congratulate the owners on achieving such a prestigious award.

The Chair extended his condolences to Councillor A. Davies and his family following the death of his brother before Christmas.

The Chair also extended his condolences to the family of Mr. John Ellis, who was the last Director of Education for the former Dyfed County Council.

The Chair reminded Council members of his charity concert which would be held on Saturday 4th February 2017 at the Ffwrnes Theatre, Llanelli.

Councillor E.G. Thomas welcomed the recent announcement by the Welsh Government that work on the Llandeilo By-Pass would be commencing in the near future. Councillor Thomas paid tribute to the Assembly Member for Dinefwr & Carmarthenshire East for negotiating the final agreement and acknowledged that this could not have been achieved had it not been for the hard work of all concerned, from both the town of Llandeilo and the County Council. He specifically thanked both elected members and officers of the County Council who had all contributed to bringing about a successful conclusion to the matter.

### 4. TO APPROVE AND SIGN AS A CORRECT RECORD THE MINUTES OF THE COUNCIL MEETING HELD ON THE 14TH DECEMBER 2016

It was **RESOLVED** that the minutes of the meeting of the Council held on the 14th December 2016, be signed as a correct record.

### 5. PRESENTATION BY MR. CHRIS DAVIES, CHIEF FIRE OFFICER, MID & WEST WALES FIRE AND RESCUE SERVICE

*Councillors D.C. Evans, D.J.R. Llewellyn, E. G. Thomas, D. E. Williams and J. Williams had earlier declared an interest in this item.*

The Chair welcomed Chief Fire Officer Chris Davies and Deputy Chief Fire Officer Mick Crennell of the Mid & West Wales Fire and Rescue Service, to the meeting.

The Chief Fire Officer's gave an overview of the work of the Fire and Rescue Service. The presentation included reference to the following issues:

- The Service's geographical area and associated challenges
- Management structure including the Executive Board of Directors and six County Command Areas
- The Fire Authority
- Financial savings already achieved

- Performance in relation to deliberate fires, accidental dwelling fires, fatalities and injuries and road traffic collisions
- Expenditure changes in real terms and public value
- Results of recent public survey
- Proposed statutory duty for Welsh Fire and Rescue Services to attend flooding incidents

The presentation was followed by a question and answer session.

The Chair thanked both the Chief and Deputy Fire Officers for their attendance at the meeting and for the presentation.

## **6. PRESENTATION BY B.T. - SUPERFAST BROADBAND**

The Chair welcomed Mr. Martin Jones, Superfast Cymru Programme Manager at the BT Group, to the meeting.

Mr. Jones' outlined progress in relation to the roll-out of fibre broadband in Carmarthenshire, since a previous update to County Council at its meeting in September 2015. The presentation included details of:

- Progress in the installation of superfast and fibre broadband across the UK, Wales and Carmarthenshire
- Significant progress in Carmarthenshire since the last update to Council with 280 out of 299 cabinets built to date and 1,656 premises left to be connected as part of the Fibre to the Cabinet work
- Structural matters, specifically relating to the location of new cabinets and wayleave issues
- Work to be completed in the final stages of the Superfast Cymru programme, due to finish in June 2017
- Changes to Superfast Cymru programme website, now hosted by the Welsh Government
- Future options for 'not-spots' and additional Welsh Government funding to obtain as close to a 100% coverage for Wales
- New residential developments and installation of fibre broadband

The presentation was followed by a question and answer session.

The Chair thanked Mr. Jones for attending the meeting to present the update.

## **7. NOTICE OF MOTION SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR JOHN JAMES**

Council considered the following Notice of Motion submitted by Councillor John James:

"This Council approaches the Chief Constable of Dyfed-Powys Police requesting that Police Officers and PCSOs issue Fixed Penalty Notices to transgressors of the Public Spaces Protection Order as stipulated in the Order.

Without enforcement, this Order, which was introduced to give this Local Authority greater flexibility and power to tackle irresponsible acts by dog owners such as dog fouling, will have little impact in reaching its desired intention.”

The Motion was duly seconded.

The proposer of the Motion was afforded the opportunity of speaking in support of the Motion and outlined the reasons for its submission.

A number of statements were made in relation to the Motion.

**RESOLVED** that the Motion be adopted.

## **8. QUESTIONS BY MEMBERS (NONE RECEIVED)**

No questions by members were received.

## **9. PUBLIC QUESTIONS**

### **9.1. QUESTION BY MR. ROBERT WILLOCK TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES (EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN)**

“We have attended all the Council meetings since this consultation started. We have gathered extensive evidence and a significant amount of questions. Many questions still remain unanswered. We are aware many of you have not attended previous meetings so we hope we will be able to explain. The School and LEA agreed that Llangennech school will become a Welsh Medium only facility in September 2016 or 2017 following a consultation period. This was agreed 18 months prior to the consultation yet the community had to read about it in the local paper. Our two County Councillors did not inform all the community council or their electorates of these intentions. Acting with closed minds they continued to go against the wishes of 95% of the village and proceed at every stage to push this through as they believe it is best for our children. A pilot of the proposal was carried out but only a small number of unnamed parents were advised and no record of these results were ever recorded in any governors meeting minutes. We have tried many times to request these findings but both the School and Carmarthenshire Council are unable to provide them. This does question whether the demand for Welsh medium in Llangennech really exists when the evidence cannot be produced. Even today is it fair to allow the two County Councillors to vote when they have made their minds up years before regardless of the wishes of their village?”

*Response by Councillor Gareth Jones (Executive Board Member for Education & Children)*

*“Local members would have sought legal advice from the Local Authority’s law department regarding your concerns.”*

Mr. Willock asked the following supplementary question:

“In the last Executive Board meeting we asked you all to read Helen Pinnock’s UNESCO report so that you could have a better and wider view of how languages should be taught, rather than being spoon-fed information that blinkers you from the truth. Almost a year ago we had a discussion with you at the outset of the consultation where we tabled a counter proposal of the Welsh and English streams mimicking each other’s language lessons (i.e. 30% Welsh lessons for English children and 30% English lessons for Welsh children). You disagreed with this proposal on the grounds that 30% Welsh lessons was too much for English children. We pointed out to you that this is only a template that could be fine-tuned by teaching professionals but now we find that you are in agreement with full immersion. Helen Pinnock’s report says that full immersion for the child whose home language is English is detrimental to the child’s education in the long term. This negative effect can blight the child’s chances of reaching full potential and therefore full immersion should be taboo. The Donaldson Report as we have seen, makes no reference to the full immersion that we can find. Now this brings me to the question. If you cannot find or produce evidence to back up your full immersion programme like the non-evidence of the pilot-scheme, this meeting should stop and the village of Llangennech should be able to carry on as normal.”

*Councillor Jones responded as follows:*

*“Thank you for sending the report from Helen Pinnock to everybody here. I could refer you to other reports as well of course, by Jim Cummings for one example, so those are other examples that can be used of course so we would be answering each other with different reports certainly. We have received it and everyone has received it.”*

**9.2. QUESTION BY MR. STEVE HATTO TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES  
(EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN)**

Council was advised that Mr. Hatto was unable to be present. The Chair requested that in his absence, Councillor G.O. Jones provide a response to the question as set out in the agenda below.

“A Governor/parent meeting at the School resulted in a vote of 68 against and 2 in support of the change. This was ignored! A simple majority of 5:1 from the proforma responses following the consultation have shown a preference to keep the existing dual stream approach. This was ignored! A further survey in response to the recent notice has resulted in over 750 further individual responses against the proposal. These were ignored! An alleged 698 supported the change, yet only 33 of those come from within the village. The majority of those in support had no address, no postcode and could not be verified. Those that had addresses were based as far as Anglesey, Denbighshire and Carmarthen. Within the village, 700 have objected to the proposals, the largest appeal in Llangennech’s history. Don’t you think it’s time for the wishes and needs of Llangennech village were respected?”

*Response by Councillor Gareth Jones (Executive Board Member for Education & Children)*

*“We are aware that responses have been received from outside the area of Llangennech, both in objection and support. However, each person has a right to voice their personal opinion. As part of any consultation, responses have to be received from all interested parties. However, it is not possible to confirm where many respondents who have submitted views in objection and in support live, as it is not a requirement to provide address/postcode at present. The decision on whether or not to proceed with the proposal must, by virtue of the law, be made on the grounds of the best interests of learners. It is therefore, the educational merits that must be the determining factor in decision making, rather than the number of responses received in favour or against the proposal.”*

**9.3. QUESTION BY MS. NIKKI LLOYD TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES (EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN)**

“The school standards and organisation (Wales) Act 2013, places a statutory duty on local authorities to assess the demand for Welsh medium education in their area through their WESP (Welsh in Education Strategic Plan). The Welsh Government requires these to measure the demand for Welsh medium education and outline their targets. Looking at the position of Llangennech schools when this process began a year ago, there were 121 children coming to the school from outside catchment area, and 96 local children leaving the village to seek education. Over the last few months a further 25+ children have now left the school to seek English medium education as a direct result of this proposal. So now 121 children come into the area and 121 leave the area! The demand for Welsh medium in Llangennech is clearly being fabricated as shown by these figures. No consideration has been given to the safety aspect of this proposal! With so many cars coming in and out of the village it is only a matter of time before an accident happens and a child is killed or injured. Has a WESP assessment been done for Llangennech to measure the demand, and if so where is the demand for ONLY Welsh medium education in Llangennech?”

*Response by Councillor Gareth Jones (Executive Board Member for Education & Children)*

*“The Welsh in Education Strategic Plans and Assessing Demand for Welsh Medium Education Regulations 2013 set out how a local authority should go about conducting a Welsh medium education assessment, should this be required by the Welsh Ministers. To date, the Welsh Ministers have not required Carmarthenshire County Council to undertake a Welsh medium education assessment. As we have a high percentage of learners accessing Welsh medium education we are not required by law to measure the demand.”*

Ms. Lloyd asked the following supplementary question:

“You say that there’s a high demand for Welsh in our school as I’ve said and a 120 coming in and out, they’re as far away as Burry Port and

Pembrey coming into our school but yet our children have to leave. 25 have recently left, there's another 10 that we know of canvassing the village, that if this vote goes through today, they will be going to the County to seek education elsewhere. Can you please explain why you still feel there is no demand in Llangennech and why 95% of the village that have democratically voiced their opinion to keep it dual-stream, to their democratically elected councillors and you're still going to ignore the voice of the village and the people that it effects?

*Councillor Jones responded as follows:*

*"Thank you. At present, at Llangennech Infants, there are 211 children, 181 attend the Welsh-stream and 30 in the English-stream. At Llangennech Junior, 175 attend the Welsh-stream and 63 attend the English-stream. I think that the evidence is there that there is demand for Welsh-medium education."*

**9.4. QUESTION BY MRS. JULIA REES TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES (EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN)**

"The LEA have made it clear through their responses that the proposal is for COMPULSORY Welsh medium education for children from the village irrespective of background. Any parent seeking an alternative will do so at their own expense and inconvenience. Further the LEA are prepared to pay transport costs for pupils from outside of the community to attend the proposed new school.

It is evident from a high level analysis that over 100 young people have been forced to seek English Medium education outside of their community due to the approach taken to date. In addition, since the requests for clarity and challenge has been put forward by the parents a further 20plus existing pupils have been forced to move to other schools where they can be taught in their home language at the parents expense. We have sought assurances that alternative provision for English medium be available and of the three schools identified Bryn, Bynea and Hendy two are already oversubscribed and the other is over an hour walk from the village through the busy junction 48 of the M4 motorway. Estyn raise this as a concern as part of the consultation process an issue which the Authority has chosen to ignore. Once again where will education be provided for children who seek English medium if it is no longer available in their own village?"

*Response by Councillor Gareth Jones (Executive Board Member for Education & Children)*

*"Thank you for the question. The County Council is not proposing alternatives to Llangennech School for local children. It is the Local Authority's desire that all current pupils remain at the school and that in the future local children attend their village school, receiving education principally through the medium of Welsh, with English being taught as a subject in Key Stage 2 and also used as a medium for instruction in some other lessons in the later years of the school."*



Mrs. Rees asked the following supplementary question:

“Going back to my original question, how can you consider that it is not discriminatory against the English medium children when you advertise the fact that transport costs will be paid for children from outside of our village to come in to learn through Welsh-medium but children born and raised and their families born and raised within our community, are denied these costs purely because they choose to leave the village to seek English-medium education which they desire, or actually need?”

*Councillor Jones responded as follows:*

*“As regards to the costs, I don’t think that children are paid to come to school, their transport costs are paid to come to Llangennech School.”*

**9.5. QUESTION BY MRS. SALLYANN THOMAS TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES (EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN)**

Council was advised that Mrs. Thomas was unable to be present. The Chair requested that in her absence, Councillor G.O. Jones provide a response to the question as set out in the agenda below.

“Compared to other Welsh medium only provision in Llanelli there are no equivalent English medium on offer for the children of Llangennech due to the location of schools. Those that are within a reasonable travelling distance are at capacity. However, we are repeatedly told that it was never the intentions of the authority for any child to leave Llangennech. Sadly this is happening already. The figure of children already left since September is nearing 25 and that’s before the proposal has been implemented. Due to these changes it is evident certain community, disability, demand and safe route assessments now need to be addressed. Do you agree that this now needs to be investigated?”

*Response by Councillor Gareth Jones (Executive Board Member for Education & Children)*

*“The Consultation Document and the consultation process have been conducted in compliance with the statutory School Organisation Code and the appropriate assessments have been considered. These proposals do not affect current pupils at the school (and I emphasise that) and there will be no change for these pupils.”*

**9.6. QUESTION BY MR. GARY JONES TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES (EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN)**

“If the Authority are adamant in bringing about this change what support is there in place for non Welsh speaking parents who may be forced to send their children to the all Welsh provision in Llangennech. How much does this support cost the Authority and/or the parents and why has it not been in place to date considering the moves taken by the school governors to

exclude English speaking children from the school has been in planning over the last 5 years?”

*Response by Councillor Gareth Jones (Executive Board Member for Education & Children)*

*“This proposal does not seek to exclude any pupils from Llangennech School. This proposal seeks to provide all pupils with the opportunity to become fully bilingual individuals who can read, write and speak in both Welsh and English. Pupils will receive their education principally through the medium of Welsh, with English being taught as a subject in Key Stage 2 and used as a medium for instruction in some other lessons in the later years of the school. There will be no change for pupils currently attending the school. Parents and pupils are supported and will continue to be supported as required. The school already provides support for English speaking parents who send their children to the Welsh stream. There are opportunities for parents to access Welsh language classes within Carmarthenshire, which may be of benefit. Advice and guidance is provided by ‘Athrawon Gwella’r Gymraeg a Dwyieithrwydd’. It is hard to quantify the cost of this provision as it is an integral part of the education/school service in Carmarthenshire.”*

Mr. Jones asked the following supplementary question:

“Could you state what services for parents to learn Welsh in Llangennech because there are none at the moment?”

*Councillor Jones responded as follows:*

*“Thank you. Examples of support provided: There’s an open door policy where teachers can translate the work for parents and provide an explanation of what is required at that time (e.g. either before or after school); parents can contact the school via telephone or email; homework is provided bilingually when needed; Welsh lessons are provided to parents at specific periods throughout the year; in the Foundation Phase specialist books are regularly sent home to parents in the home language that enables parents to see what pupils achieve in the school; a homework club is held for an hour after school once a week to provide support for pupils who require help with their homework; sports, choir and iPad clubs are held bilingually; the Urdd Club – many children from the English-stream currently attend; the school website is bilingual; there are bilingual staff members in both streams; bilingual school assemblies and singing lessons - pupils learn a mixture of Welsh and English songs; bilingual school productions; the Athrawon Bro provide support to help and develop the Welsh skills of pupils; they also hold a language centre for a full week during the summer term for groups of Year 5 pupils - these are pupils who currently perform at Level 3 but who can attain Level 4 with professional input; older pupils have strong Welsh skills which enables them to explain homework to their parents; the Athrawon Bro provide training to staff members who are less confident in using their Welsh skills; the Welsh language is heard daily by English stream pupils; the school are also intending to hold an evening for*

*parents of all classes at the beginning of September detailing the themes of work for the year and the content of the work.”*

**9.7. QUESTION BY MRS. KAREN HUGHES TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES (EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN)**

“The Keep Dual Stream Group are local parents and grandparents who originally became concerned over the lack of awareness around these school proposals. We have spent hundreds of hours over the past year extensively researching the facts and on average have lost over 5 days annual leave per person to attend just these meetings. Of course, this is not an issue if we were being listened to. Unfortunately we are not. Despite raising concerns around children with special needs learning abilities, to environmental impacts, negative impacts on the Welsh Language itself, to social issues, at no time have these been documented or the community assessment re-evaluated. There were 7 options supposedly on the table during the start of the consultation. Only one has ever been put forward and discussed and there has been no attempt to find any common ground or discuss any other options. The main purpose of the consultation is to allow the public to be able to influence decisions that impact them. Despite proving beyond reasonable doubt that demand has been socially engineered, it is in fact coming from outside the village and an overwhelming 95% are against these proposals, you continually fail to acknowledge that the consultation findings are inaccurate and misleading even in the face of hard evidence. We note that you have on more than one occasion stated that ‘Carmarthenshire Council know what’s best for your child’s education’ and on these grounds have set the pretext that you will overrule whatever opposition you encounter. We do not like being subjected to a dictatorship. We feel that a mockery has been made of the consultation, the law and the democratic rights of the villagers. So that we understand the precedent being set here today for this and future consultations, can you explain how you believe it has been worth consulting with the public when you were always going to dictate that you knew best and ignore any new information?”

*Response by Councillor Gareth Jones (Executive Board Member for Education & Children)*

*“The Local Authority appreciate all the views that have been put forward during this consultation process. All views presented as part of the consultation process have been and will be considered, as is required of the Local Authority before a final decision is made on this proposal. However, the preferred option remains the same.*

*At each stage of the process, each report has been carefully considered by members before a decision to proceed has been made. No final decision has yet been made on this proposal until members of the Council vote today. Before taking their vote, each member will have considered the contents of each report carefully.”*

Mrs. Hughes asked the following supplementary question:

“What is interesting is that obviously we know that all Councils have been required to produce Welsh in Education Strategic Plans. What is interesting is that when you look at South Wales – Cardiff, Newport, Swansea – they are all engaging with their public. They are producing surveys, they are assessing where there is demand and therefore they are building Welsh schools in the right areas. They are taking the public along their journey. You have said previously that the best interests of learners must take precedent. Do you believe an authoritarian stance achieves that?”

*Councillor Jones responded as follows:*

*“As I mentioned previously, I think this is the fifth time we have met now with different questions so we have been listening and the vote has been taken by different people. It is not an individual decision. You have been listened to so that is part of the democratic process as well.”*

**9.8. QUESTION BY MR. NIGEL HUGHES TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES (EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN)**

“WALES as stated by the Language Commissioner has two recognised languages, Welsh and English which are to be treated equally. The removal of the Dual Stream will undoubtedly cause the creation of a county of isolation and seclusion. It is probable that Carmarthenshire must be one of the few places in the world which is decreasing its use of the English language at a time when more and more countries are encouraging its usage due to business and internet demands. This is not placing Wales on an equal playing field and will impact all aspects of life from technology to Health. There are over 2 billion English speakers in the world; it is imperative that every child is 100% fluent in English, both written and orally as it will enable them to map out a career virtually wherever their dreams take them. So can Carmarthenshire County Council please explain in detail, if they do indeed have a strategy, how they intend to attract new businesses and expertise to the County when you will only offer Welsh Medium education? This may not be suitable for everyone whereas a Dual Stream strategy is a Win–Win.”

*Response by Councillor Gareth Jones (Executive Board Member for Education & Children)*

*“Pupils attending the Welsh stream in Llangennech leave school with two first languages with proficiency in both Welsh and English – having received a truly bilingual education. The Local Authority see the Welsh language as a key skill in Wales which will provide learners with even more opportunities for work in the future and it is acknowledged that learning a second language is also useful when learning a third or even a fourth language. That is the definition of the Welsh medium education and we expect the pupils of Llangennech to be fully bilingual.”*

Mr. Hughes asked the following supplementary question:

“The Welsh Medium Education Strategy, as agreed by the Welsh Assembly, states that the vision is to create a Wales where people may choose to live their lives through the medium of either or both Welsh or English. There is good reason for this as we are a nation of two languages and we should be making both available to attract all new businesses and investments. This is supported by Helen Pinnock, an UNESCO world renowned expert who says that for true bilingualism to exist you need to have the support and consent of the parents and the community – you have neither. Please can you explain why you do not share the same vision as the Welsh Assembly and other Welsh Councils by not believing in creating a Wales where people choose to speak Welsh, English or both.”

*Councillor Jones responded as follows:*

*“We are not dictating which language people want to speak. What we are trying to encourage is the use of Welsh by all the young people in the Llangennech area.”*

**9.9. QUESTION BY MR. DARREN SEWARD TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES (EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN)**

“We have for too long been a majority without a representative voice. Whether or not you agree with the school proposals, we hope you will agree that the right way to represent an electorate is the democratic way. We are disappointed that our local councillors have rallied behind a move to change Llangennech from Dual Stream into Welsh Medium only without engaging the village and have even gone as far as using the media to criticise and spew fake news that we are nothing but a ‘vociferous minority’ . Of course with around 700 villagers opposing the changes probably the largest appeal in the history of Llangennech, this could not be further from the truth and it is disappointing that neither candidate understand their own electorate better or at worse, choose to ignore it. It is also disappointing that the plan to change Llangennech School into Welsh Medium only was never mentioned in their political manifesto or local newsletters. This lack of transparency and openness has created frustrations when real issues that are ultimately going to change the lives of our children and our community are overlooked and are dealt with in a clandestine manner!

In fact it states on Plaid Cymru’s website, that Plaid Cymru’s policy is to ensure that within the foundation phase, every child across Wales should have access to Welsh Medium. As a group, we wholeheartedly support this vision and are 100% behind this move. What shocks us is that a Plaid led Council have overseen the WESP document, targeting Llangennech School when it already meets with your policy on providing the availability of Welsh Medium education within the area. Making Welsh Medium available does not equate to the eradication of English Medium schools and we feel that your voters are being misled as to your intentions. Please can you therefore explain why Plaid’s policy is to make Welsh medium available whereas what you are doing in reality is very different as you are removing English

Medium schools, forcing Welsh by compulsion and removing freedom of choice?”

*Response by Councillor Gareth Jones (Executive Board Member for Education & Children)*

*“The Welsh Government have a range of policies and strategies in place for the expansion of Welsh medium education, which places responsibilities and expectations on all Local Authorities. These include:*

- *Welsh in Education Strategic Plan (WESP)*
- *Welsh Medium Education Strategy*
- *Welsh Language Strategy 2012-2017 – A Living Language: A Language for Living*
- *Increasing the Number of Communities where Welsh is the Main Language*
- *The WG are also currently consulting on a strategy to develop 1 million Welsh speakers.*

*We also have a responsibility to respond to Carmarthenshire County Council’s report that was developed following the 2011 Census which showed that the percentage of the number of Welsh speakers in Carmarthenshire had decreased.”*

Mr. Seward asked the following supplementary question:

“For once, I think that we can all agree the Welsh language has been in decline for decades and we all want to revive and preserve it. However, like many decisions taken lately regarding the Welsh language, I feel the implementation needs some adjustment. The old saying more haste, less speed comes to mind as something that has been declining for so long cannot miraculously be brought back overnight. It is, however, and will remain a minority language and the more it is forced upon people the less support it will receive. So would you not agree that after all the evidence-based information we have presented to you over the last 12 months and the unprecedented number of objections in the history of Llangennech village, your heavy handed approach will result in the opposite effect and just encourage opposition.”

*Councillor Jones responded as follows:*

*“I wouldn’t agree with your comments entirely. Thank you for the comments and those will be taken on board as well.”*

**9.10. QUESTION BY MRS. VANESSA WILLOCK TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES (EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN)**

Council was advised that Mrs. Willock was unable to be present. The Chair requested that in her absence, Councillor G.O. Jones provide a response to the question as set out in the agenda below.

“Many are supportive of a dual stream approach as it gives parents the option to allow children to try the Welsh medium approach but with a degree of comfort that if their children fall behind on the educational continuum then they have the opportunity to switch to English medium without losing out on their village identity. We are aware that parents are already using their discretion and moving children to English medium schools as they are fearful that they may not be able to support their children in their formative years due to the fact that they will not be able to understand homework and basic school issues as they do not have sufficient grasp of the Welsh language themselves.

Experts will always agree to disagree but all can sign up to the fact that mother knows best. In this case mother would like her children to be taught the basic of their education in the language of the home and to be part of a planned programme of learning Welsh as part of a wider curriculum. Do you think it is right to take freedom of choice away from parents and their children?”

*Response by Councillor Gareth Jones (Executive Board Member for Education & Children)*

*“Choice is an important issue in the consideration of this proposal with the most important aspect of choice being that which is available to children as they progress through their education and early lives. This proposal provides all pupils with the opportunity to become fully bilingual with the skills to read, write and speak in both Welsh and English languages by the time they leave primary school. The Local Authority’s proposal to develop bilingual children by the time they leave primary school gives children a choice as they move forward to secondary school. The most effective way of developing bilingual children in the primary sector is to immerse them in Welsh medium education. It is generally accepted in the education profession that studying Welsh as a second language does not develop truly bilingual young people.”*

**9.11. QUESTION BY MRS. KAREN DEACON TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES (EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN)**

Council was advised that Mrs. Deacon was unable to be present. The Chair requested that in her absence, Councillor G.O. Jones provide a response to the question as set out in the agenda below.

“It is thanks to this consultation, that I found the truth behind why my children were struggling so much at Llangennech School. As it was revealed that they were not in a proper dual stream class as we were lead to believe, but in fact in a Welsh Medium class and had not been taught any English for two years. It’s been a very stressful few years, as parents trying to get to the bottom of this situation, constantly asking and emailing, so I really would like to express my sincere gratitude for helping me with those answers and in turn getting them all into a much more productive and happier school environment. To be clear before I carry on, our choice to remove all my children from Llangennech schools, was ultimately due to the

excessive lies around the situation and inability to ever trust the school again and not because we were against them learning Welsh, I really do wish to emphasise that.

As a parent I have experienced first-hand my parental choice of education for my children being taken away from me and a Welsh Medium education forced upon our family. It was a struggle in an English-speaking home environment to help with Welsh homework and was emotionally upsetting and frustrating for my children struggling to translate Welsh to English, so we could try and help them. Thankfully, there is still English Medium schools in Carmarthenshire and I was still allowed to choose to send all four of my children to one in Llanelli, which I can't praise enough and the move has been a blessing in disguise. Although, no longer a parent of Llangennech school, with a child yet to start Primary and of course all the others going onto secondary within Carmarthenshire, it means this consultation is still very relevant to my family, as Carmarthenshire Councils plans are to eventually completely eradicate English Medium Education across the county.

Shortly after my Twins went into Year 1 in their new school, the deputy head explained to me that my Twins English is really poor. In fact, their level of English is that similar to a child from a foreign country. They went on to explain that for my Twins this term would be mainly playing catch up, to bring them up to the level of where they should be for their age group, a whole term on catch up not new learning. However reassuringly they also confirmed that due to the academic level shown by the Twins in Welsh, it proves their poor English is not down to their mental aptitude, but lack of teaching it to them. Unfortunately, their English has gone backwards and they are now having to re-learn what they did in the Nursery setting before they attended Llangennech Welsh Medium classes. Due to a nonbilingual home, there is evidence of confusion of the languages. But we are all able to help now with basics of counting in English and the English alphabet. I'm of course delighted that they are both good with their Welsh, but so are my other children who went through a proper Dual Stream system at Llangennech Primary and their English did not suffer, because they learnt Welsh unlike the Twins has. As a family, we travel all over the UK and while visiting their cousins in Scotland over the summer the Twins struggled joining in with things like board games and alphabet dot to dot all the kids were bought, which really upset them being excluded from such fun. I think in 2017 it would be silly to think that no-one will ever leave Wales and with the digital world supporting more and more jobs, worldwide English dominates as the online global language and I worry because as confirmed by teachers, my twins are already at the age of 6 at a disadvantage compared to other little kids their age in the UK, which essential are their future competition for Uni places and Jobs.

Moving forward my reality as a mum, is one that - one of my Twins are catching up quicker than the other in English, making me dread how I explain to one Twin why they must stay behind a year while the other twin moves up, because their teacher seriously has not ruled this out as a possibility as without the basic Core English elements nailed, they can go onto to learn anything else. As teaching goes the facts prove that when it



comes to my children I am their best teacher. I have a 100% success rate. As a parent I have taught each of them things like how to sit, walk, talk, eat solids, to use the toilet, ride a bike, swim and to smile and laugh and I have not failed, because as their mum I know my kids and how each of them needed to learn in different ways. By identifying this and teaching them in the way they needed, it allowed them to achieve their best and I did not fail them, making me an expert in knowing what ways will work best for them to learn within our family setting. However, within a Welsh Medium Education system qualified teachers for two years did fail to teach my Twins a good level of English. Which to be fair isn't necessarily a reflection of the teacher, because after all they all spent many years gaining qualification and experience to be an expert in the process of teaching children successfully. No this is more down to the fact they were not allowed to identify and teach the child in the way the child needed, having to focus on the Welsh Medium Method as the only option.

So my question is very simple taking your opinion, thoughts wants and desires on the matter out of the equation for a minute, I would just really love to hear only an exact list of what your personal qualifications, expertise, scientific knowledge, experience and skills are that makes you the expert and best person/ people to make the final decision that could prevent children ever learning via English Medium again in Llangennech school and ultimately all Carmarthenshire Schools and the expert that knows better than I and therefore must take away my parental choice of choosing the learning method I know my babies will learn the best in, for them to truly flourish as successful little learners?"

*Response by Councillor Gareth Jones (Executive Board Member for Education & Children)*

*"When considering school reorganisation proposals, relevant officers such as head teachers, teachers, psychologists, additional learning need teachers etc. are consulted for their advice and opinions. I am not the person making the final decision on this proposal. The final decision will be made by members of the County Council."*

**9.12. QUESTION BY MRS. MICHAELA BEDDOWS TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES (EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN)**

"Whilst we support providing all children throughout Wales with the availability of Welsh Medium, we do not believe in Welsh by compulsion and believe it will ultimately damage the survival of the Welsh language and people's passion for learning it. If this consultation has taught us anything, it is that Welsh by compulsion in fact breeds resentment and more so when people's concerns are not being acknowledged and freedom of choice is removed. Carmarthenshire Council has been presented with a year's worth of research from Llangennech community, yet has dismissed all of it, stating that they 'know best for our children's education' based on the back of the Donaldson report which allegedly supports Welsh immersion. As far as we are aware the Donaldson report does not recommend either Welsh immersion or the elimination of English Medium schools. It highlights that

Welsh education must be compulsory from age 3 to 16. This can take the form of Welsh lessons for English medium schools which again we totally support. We feel that we have been repeatedly misled on the actual findings of the Donaldson report and what it actually recommends. In fact, we would be very surprised if Professor Donaldson would produce a report which contradicts that of UNESCO. UNESCO, an international organisation providing advice to over 150 countries, are very clear that 'children who are taught in their home language in their early years are more likely to achieve their full potential'. Please can you provide an explanation including the degree of professionalism being relied upon which has led to the belief that Carmarthenshire County Council are better placed than the likes of UNESCO on children's education?"

*Response by Councillor Gareth Jones (Executive Board Member for Education & Children)*

*"The Donaldson Report has been accepted by all political parties in Cardiff and I think it should be taken up with them what they and UNESCO don't agree on. The Donaldson Report itself – Successful Futures – has 68 recommendations, 10 of which refer to Welsh medium provision. As you mentioned, the Welsh language should remain compulsory up to the age of 16. Secondly, Investment in and improvements to provision and the raising of standards should focus on strengthening the language in primary schools in order to create a solid foundations for learning in Welsh and other languages in secondary school. There will also be a need for support for secondary schools to enable them to improve and adjust their provision. The language continuum for secondary schools in Carmarthenshire. The value attached to the Welsh language by children and young people, teachers, parents and carers and the public should be enhanced by strengthening the focus on its commercial value for the jobs market, the suggested cognitive benefits of bilingualism and its importance in enabling children and young people to achieve a good understanding of the cultural life of Wales in the past and present. As mentioned previously, there are also other Welsh Government strategies which the County Council needs to respond to."*

Mrs. Beddows asked the following supplementary question:

"I totally agree with what you have said, up to a point, that children should be learning Welsh. I absolutely agree every child in Wales should learn Welsh but they should not be forced to learn entirely in Welsh because as far as I'm concerned not every child can learn in Welsh. I have seen that first hand for myself with my own child. Can you honestly say, hand on heart, as a parent, that this suits every child in Wales?"

*Councillor Jones responded as follows:*

*"Every Authority in Wales has a different situation. It is difficult to generalise on the question and the answer really so I will leave it at that."*

**9.13. QUESTION BY MR. PHILLIP WILLOCK TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES (EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN)**

Council was advised that Mr. Willock was unable to be present. The Chair requested that in his absence, Councillor G.O. Jones provide a response to the question as set out in the agenda below.

“Early years children are disadvantaged if they are not taught in the language of the household. Research by Dr Angelina Kioko along with Helen Pinnocks UNSENCO report and the PISA test results show this. In the Pisa results Finnish children start school at aged seven and are taught in the language of the household. Finland who finished fifth in the Pisa results were only a handful of marks behind first place Singapore. Finland like Wales has an indigenous language “Sami”. By embracing the household language for the needs of the child and not mixing political alteria motives with education then Finland are racing ahead of Wales. Dr Kioko points out that when children start school they are put into a new environment with a new point of Authority. If you bring in a language change it will complicate the learning process. You will be advised that experts say that full immersion is the only way whilst others linked to UNESCO say that initial learning must be via the language used at home. The consultation only refers to reports that support the change. To make a decision all reports should have been provided. Only when we brought it up in the last executive board meeting two members abstained to look into this. To make a decision all evidence and reports should have been provided from the onset not just one sided ones. Can you confidently say all the facts and reports have been presented to enable councillors to make a decision?”

*Response by Councillor Gareth Jones (Executive Board Member for Education & Children)*

*“Officers have considered a range of different reports and strategies when considering this proposal and these are noted in the report presented to the County Council today. All questions and answers from previous meetings have been presented to councillors along with the Consultation Document, Consultation Report, Statutory Notice and the Objection Report for their consideration.”*

**9.14. QUESTION BY MR. DEAN BOLGIANI TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES (EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN)**

“I think everyone that’s here with me today would agree, that we all support the Welsh language and the importance of maintaining it. As a parent I believe it is crucial that my children learn and understand a good level of Welsh, however I believe the local authority’s time and resources would be better served implementing Welsh streams within English medium schools, increasing the number of dual stream schools. This would impact on a fair great number of children and support parental choice to allow their children to learn other subjects through the medium of English... Do you agree?”

*Response by Councillor Gareth Jones (Executive Board Member for Education & Children)*

*“Thank you for your positive comments concerning the Welsh language, I am very grateful for that. In order for pupils to become fully bilingual, children need to follow a first language Welsh curriculum and study subjects through the medium of Welsh. As I have mentioned previously, English will be taught as a subject in Key Stage 2 at Llangennech and also used as a medium of instruction for other subjects as well. It is Carmarthenshire County Council’s aim that pupils will be fully bilingual in both Welsh and English languages when they leave for secondary school. The purpose of the WESP is to further develop Welsh medium education in Carmarthenshire and move all schools along the Welsh language continuum.”*

Mr. Bolgiani asked the following supplementary question:

“Even with this policy to increase the level of Welsh, is it still the aim for all schools, when inspected, to achieve a green status, which at present Llangennech school has in its current form. Do you all agree that you have targetted a high achieving school whereas there are several within the Local Authority that are currently only achieving amber. Does this not prove that our dual stream school provides our children with the best education and would the Local Authority’s time, resources and policies be best implemented following this proven structure?”

*Councillor Jones responded as follows:*

*“Every school within Carmarthenshire, both primary and secondary, are expected to follow the path along the language continuum.”*

**9.15. QUESTION BY MRS. VICKI FREEMAN TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES (EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN)**

Council was advised that Mrs. Freeman was unable to be present. The Chair requested that in her absence, Councillor G.O. Jones provide a response to the question as set out in the agenda below:

“Special Educational Needs: The phrase is self-explanatory in so far as children need addition support to achieve educational outcomes. As part of the response within the document the LEA have set out that those with SEN will get support through the medium of Welsh. We are therefore looking at a scenario where an individual pupil from an English speaking home is put into an environment where not only their basic educational needs must be supported they are expected to learn a new language, Welsh. However, they may find it difficult if the home language is not welsh speaking.

Again the LEA have been looking at these issues through rose tinted glasses and have not considered the effect on the family unit by enforcing the Welsh medium only education at the school. In addition, LEA have

made it clear that they will not support travelling costs to another school which puts the SEN pupil at the outer edge of the community in Llangennech. Can you honestly say you are taking these factors into consideration in the proposal when a disability assessment has not even been carried out?"

*Response by Councillor Gareth Jones (Executive Board Member for Education & Children)*

*"Carmarthenshire schools are very experienced and proficient in supporting learners with SEN/ALN. Schools and the Local Authority have staff which are able to provide support and advice to parents when required and based on their needs. Each case will be considered on an individual basis and support will be provided as necessary."*

**9.16. QUESTION BY MRS. JACQUELINE SEWARD TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES (EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN)**

"As we prepare for the final chapter here today it's worrying that there are reports still unread and many questions still not adequately answered.

We hope having listened to us you have come to the conclusion that we are not against the Welsh language at all, but a group of parents/grandparents and concerned residents who just want their freedom of choice when choosing their education path for their children. The questions and information you have heard today and to date are all evidence based.

Unfortunately, no matter what evidence we present, it is dismissed and we are only assured that Carmarthen Council believe they know what is best for our children. We believe every child is different and each child has the right to be educated in the language of their choice. We have already seen the division the proposal is causing in the village.

Llangennech is a successful dual stream School who cater for all with excellent results. Children from the English stream go on to have A\* s in GCSE welsh but excel in other core subjects too. In a dual stream setting children learn at their pace in a language of their choice that suits their abilities. Llangennech is proof that this works and this is the example we should follow. By forcing the welsh language on communities it will only end up diluting it. We all agree that we should be striving to keep the Welsh language and heritage of Wales but it needs to be desired and proportional to demand. This is already proven in Llangennech with many parents willing to try the welsh stream. The dual stream has worked for the last 60 years. It doesn't need to change. Unfortunately, this proposal has misled many into believing there is no demand for an English medium at Llangennech.

This approach is putting the wellbeing of young people at risk within the community particularly those from disadvantaged backgrounds who may not be able to afford to travel to other schools at their own expense and

may struggle in the Welsh stream due to lack of support at home or to language issues. We have tried to engage with the Authority on these issues but have recently been advised within the Education scrutiny committee that this is not a case of listening to the democratic voice of the people within the village but the imposition of full immersion Welsh language teaching for all within the Llangennech community. Full immersion Welsh that doesn't even appear on Plaid Cymru's policy as it simply states to make "Welsh available" which is exactly what the Llangennech dual stream setting does now.

If the proposal is allowed and in light of the over whelming 95% of people from the village who are against the proposal, then the new school cannot be truly called a community school as it will not be properly representing the community that is Llangennech. I ask the councillors here present today if it was your ward, which it could be very soon would you go against your electorates wishes or would you have the courage of your convictions and stand up and support the community that trusted you to represent them. We therefore urge you to look into this whole process before it has a long-standing effect on the future of children and the community of Llangennech. Are you able to make the decision today with many questions still unanswered and on the strengths of beliefs and not evidence?"

*Response by Councillor Gareth Jones (Executive Board Member for Education & Children)*

*"The consultation document, consultation report, statutory notice and the objection report collated throughout this consultation have been presented to members for their consideration, as required. They all have a copy so I think that your question is targeted to all the members present here today rather than myself."*

Mrs. Seward asked the following supplementary question:

"We, the concerned parents, children, grandparents and 95% of the village will have to live with the consequences of this irrational approach. Are you able to prove to us and be confident that you have the evidence to say that this is the right decision?"

*Councillor Jones responded as follows:*

*"I think that the decision is going to be made by members this morning. All the evidence has been given to them, you have had several chances to produce evidence which you have brought with you and I thank you for that. We will leave it up to the members."*

The Chair thanked the questioners for their attendance at the meeting.

## 10. COUNCIL TAX REDUCTION SCHEME 2017/2018

*Councillor A.D.T. Speake had earlier declared an interest in this item.*

The Council considered a report on the Council Tax Reduction Scheme for 2017/18. It was informed that in 2013, the Westminster Government replaced the national Council Tax Benefit Scheme with a localised scheme. In England, councils operated their own individual schemes, however, in Wales responsibility was devolved to the Welsh Government and an all-Wales scheme was developed which has been in place since that time. The funding provided to Welsh Government for the scheme had been re-distributed to individual councils. This allocation had not been adjusted since the Council Tax Reduction Scheme was introduced and therefore individual authorities had to make up any on-going shortfalls due to higher expenditure.

The Executive Board Member for Resources reminded members that although it was a single all-Wales scheme, councils had to re-adopt the scheme annually if they wished to take advantage of the limited discretionary powers they had to vary the standard scheme. These three areas were outlined in the attached report. He reminded members that since the scheme had been introduced, Carmarthenshire had, in common with most Welsh authorities, used its discretionary powers and fully disregarded any Disablement Pensions, War Widows Pensions and similar payments when calculating entitlement. He reminded members that by accepting the recommendations contained in the report, Carmarthenshire would continue to disregard these payments.

The proposals were moved and seconded.

**RESOLVED** that Carmarthenshire County Council:

- 10.1 Formally adopts the standard all-Wales Council Tax Reduction scheme provided for in the:
  - a) Council Tax Reduction Schemes and Prescribed Requirements (Wales) Regulations 2013, and
  - b) Council Tax Reduction Schemes (Prescribed Requirements and Default Scheme) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2014.
- 10.2 Implements the annual up-rating figures (used in entitlement calculations) and other minor technical amendments, included in the Council Tax Reduction Schemes (Prescribed Requirements and Default Scheme) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2017 that are due to come into force on 18th January 2017.
- 10.3 Continues to exercise its discretion with regard to the limited discretionary elements of the prescribed scheme as outlined in the Executive Summary.

**11. TO CONSIDER THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD IN RESPECT OF THE FOLLOWING ITEMS:**

**11.1. MODERNISING EDUCATION PROVISION - PROPOSAL TO DISCONTINUE LLANGENNECH INFANT SCHOOL AND LLANGENNECH JUNIOR SCHOOL AND ESTABLISH LLANGENNECH COMMUNITY PRIMARY SCHOOL**

*Councillors J.A. Davies, J. Edmunds, L.D. Evans, W. G. Hopkins, G.O. Jones, E. G. Thomas, G. Thomas had earlier declared an interest in this item.*

Council was informed that the Executive Board, at its meeting held on the 22nd December 2016, had considered the Modernising Education Programme proposal to discontinue Llangennech Infant and Junior Schools and establish Llangennech Community Primary School.

The Executive Board Member for Education & Children and the Interim Director for Education & Children outlined the key considerations and policies underpinning the proposal for Llangennech.

The proposals outlined in the report were moved and seconded.

A number of statements were made in support of the proposal and the importance of promoting Welsh-medium education in the County.

A number of statements were also made objecting to the proposal with concerns voiced regarding the process followed in seeking to implement the proposal.

**DURATION OF MEETING**

At 1:00pm, Council's attention was drawn to Council Procedure Rule 9.1 'Duration of Meeting' and Council Procedure Rule 22.1 'Suspension' and as the meeting had been underway for three hours, it was accordingly **RESOLVED** to suspend the Council Rules of Procedure in order to consider the remaining items on the agenda.

The following amendment to the Motion was proposed by Councillor A.G. Morgan and duly seconded:

"Due to the procedural uncertainty and concerns expressed by a large number of local people that we recommend the Council delay a decision today and reconsider this matter and fully engage with the community and school to see if a consensus can be found in order that the school and community of Llangennech can come together to properly promote and provide Welsh language education in the locality."



Following a requisition by more than ten members in accordance with Council Procedural Rule 16.4, a recorded vote was taken on the amendment with the votes cast being as follows:

### **For the Amendment (20)**

Councillors S.M. Allen, S.M. Caiach, A.P. Cooper, D.M. Cundy, S.L. Davies, T. Davies, W.R.A. Davies, T. Devichand, J.S. Edmunds, P. Edwards, J.D. James, A.W. Jones, K. Madge, S. Matthews, A.G. Morgan, H.B. Shepardson, M.K. Thomas, W.G. Thomas, J. Williams

### **Against the Amendment (37)**

Councillors D.J.R. Bartlett, C.A. Campbell, J.M. Charles, A. Davies, J.A. Davies, E. Dole, H.A.L. Evans, L.D. Evans, W.J.W. Evans, W.T. Evans, A.D. Harries, C.P. Higgins, W.G. Hopkins, J.K. Howell, P. Hughes-Griffiths, P.M. Hughes, I.J. Jackson, A. James, D.M. Jenkins, G.O. Jones, T.J. Jones, A. Lenny, M.J.A. Lewis, D.J.R. Llewellyn, J. Owen, D. Price, A.D.T. Speake, L.M. Stephens, E.G. Thomas, G.B. Thomas, G. Thomas, R. Thomas, S.E. Thomas, D. Tomos, D.E. Williams, J.E. Williams, J.S. Williams

### **Abstentions (2)**

Councillors D.B. Davies and P.A. Palmer

*[Note: Councillors G. Davies, D.C. Evans, J.P. Jenkins, D.W.H. Richards and B.A.L. Roberts were in attendance at the meeting but were not present in the Chamber during the vote]*

It was therefore **RESOLVED** that the Amendment to the Motion not be supported.

Council proceeded to vote on the substantive Motion with the votes cast being as follows:

### **For the Motion (38)**

Councillors D.J.R. Bartlett, C.A. Campbell, J.M. Charles, A. Davies, D.B. Davies, J.A. Davies, E. Dole, H.A.L. Evans, L.D. Evans, W.J.W. Evans, W.T. Evans, A.D. Harries, C.P. Higgins, W.G. Hopkins, J.K. Howell, P. Hughes-Griffiths, P.M. Hughes, I.J. Jackson, A. James, D.M. Jenkins, G.O. Jones, T.J. Jones, A. Lenny, M.J.A. Lewis, D.J.R. Llewellyn, J. Owen, D. Price, A.D.T. Speake, L.M. Stephens, E.G. Thomas, G.B. Thomas, G. Thomas, R. Thomas, S.E. Thomas, D. Tomos, D.E. Williams, J.E. Williams, J.S. Williams

### **Against the Motion (20)**

Councillors S.M. Allen, S.M. Caiach, A.P. Cooper, D.M. Cundy, S.L. Davies, T. Davies, W.R.A. Davies, T. Devichand, J.S. Edmunds, P. Edwards, J.D.

James, A.W. Jones, K. Madge, S. Matthews, A.G. Morgan, H.B. Shepardson, M.K. Thomas, W.G. Thomas, J. Williams

### **Abstention (1)**

Councillor P.A. Palmer

*[Note: Councillors G. Davies, D.C. Evans, J.P. Jenkins, D.W.H. Richards and B.A.L. Roberts were in attendance at the meeting but were not present in the Chamber during the vote]*

**RESOLVED** that the Motion be adopted and that:

- 11.1.1 The Executive Board's recommendation that the submissions received to the Statutory Notice and the Authority's responses thereto, as detailed in the Objection Report, be noted;
- 11.1.2 Being satisfied that there are no other related proposals; that the statutory proposal has been consulted upon and published in accordance with the School Organisation Code and contains all the relevant information and, having considered the consultation document and consultation report, the objections and any responses to the notice supporting the proposal in the objection report, the proposal as laid out in the Statutory Notice be implemented.

### **11.2. PUBLIC SERVICE BOARD SCRUTINY**

Council **RESOLVED** to defer consideration of this item to the Council's next scheduled meeting.

### **11.3. SCHOOL STAFF ABSENCE SCHEME**

Council **RESOLVED** to defer consideration of this item to the Council's next scheduled meeting.

### **11.4. CARMARTHENSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL'S GUIDANCE AND SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENT ON CHARGEABLE PRE-APPLICATION AND POST CONSENT ADVICE IN RELATION TO DEVELOPMENTS OF NATIONAL SIGNIFICANCE (PLANNING (WALES) ACT 2015) AND NATIONALLY SIGNIFICANT INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECTS (PLANNING ACT 2008)**

Council **RESOLVED** to defer consideration of this item to the Council's next scheduled meeting.

## **12. TO RECEIVE THE REPORT OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD HELD ON THE 22ND DECEMBER 2016**

Council **RESOLVED** to defer consideration of this item to the Council's next scheduled meeting.

**13. MINUTES FOR INFORMATION (AVAILABLE TO VIEW ON THE COUNCIL'S WEBSITE)**

Council **RESOLVED** to defer consideration of this item to the Council's next scheduled meeting.

\_\_\_\_\_  
**CHAIR**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**DATE**